

Gondviselés és piaci koordináció

Kornai János 85.
születésnapja tiszteletére
rendezett konferencia
előadása

Centralizáció - decentralizáció

- Ősrégen folyik a vita a centralizáció és a decentralizáció előnyeiről és hátrányairól. Olyan nevek ugranak be itt az emlékezetembe, mint Adam Smith, Marx, Hayek és Lenin, vagy az elméleti matematikai közgazdaságtan nagyjai, a Nobel-díjas Arrow és Hurwicz. Azt hittem, naiv módon, hogy ezek a viták Magyarországon egyetemi elmélettörténeti órákon kerülhetnek csak elő, intellektuális csemegeként. Szó sincs róla! A vita, úgy látszik, ismét időszerű.

Vertikális és horizontális koordináció

- Az első modellben láthatóak a kezek: a főnök parancsra figyelmeztető és – ha kell – fenyegető keze. A második modellben, Adam Smith remek kifejezésével, „láthatatlan kéz” vezérli a koordinációt.
- Az első modellhez hasonló képződmény testesül meg az államban (noha sohasem annyira tiszta formában, mint ahogy azt a elméleti modell ábrázolja.) A második modellhez kétféle szféra hasonlít. Az egyik a piac, amelyben az összehangolódást a jól felfogott anyagi érdek motiválja, és az eladó és a vevő megegyezéseiben testesül meg. A másik horizontálisan koordinált szférában működnek a nonprofit szervezetek, a különböző szabad társulások és egyesületek, a „civil társadalom” csoportosulásai. Motivációikban keveredhetnek az anyagi és nem anyagi ösztönzők.

Whig history versus Christian political economy

- Tory writers in the first half of nineteenth century usually presented as backward, romantic traditionalists, incapable of grasping the rationality of the new science of political economy.
- Protectionism: 1815 Corn Law...
- and moral repudiation of political economy.
- By the 1840s the conservative party moved towards becoming the party of free trade and a largely self-regulating market.

Egy XIX. századi politökonómia professzor: Whately érsek

That Political-Economy should have been complained of as hostile to Religion, will probably be regarded a century hence (should the fact be then on record) with the same wonder, almost approaching to incredulity, with which we of the present day hear of men sincerely opposing, on religious grounds, the Copernican system.

Hogyan lehet megoldani egy milliós nagyváros ellátását?

Now let any one consider this problem in all its bearings, reflecting on the enormous and fluctuating number of persons to be fed—the immense quantity, and the variety, of the provisions to be furnished, the importance of a convenient distribution of them, and the necessity of husbanding them discreetly ; and then let him reflect on the anxious toil which such a task would impose on a board of the most experienced and intelligent commissaries ; who after all would be able to discharge their office but very inadequately.

the most important objects are accomplished by the joint agency of persons who never think of them, nor have any idea of acting in concert ; and that, with a certainty, completeness, and regularity, which probably the most diligent benevolence under the guidance of the greatest human wisdom could never have attained.

But the point to which I wish to call your attention, as most pertinent to the present inquiry, is, that by the wise and benevolent arrangement of Providence, even those who are thinking only of their own credit and advantage, are, in the pursuit of these selfish objects, led, unconsciously, to benefit others: the public welfare is not left to depend merely on the operation of public-spirit.

C.Ripa: Iconologia – az 1778-as angol kiadás



Denotes the care and protection of God over created beings.* It is allegorically represented by the figure of a venerable matron, nobly dressed in white robes, elevated on the clouds, and crowned with a garland of the ears of corn and grapes: she is holding two keys in one hand, and the helm of a ship in the other; the figure of an eye is placed on her breast, surrounded by rays of light, and the globe of the earth below the clouds, from which descends the dropping dew. She is represented a venerable matron, dressed in white robes, seated on the clouds, and crowned with the ears of corn and grapes, to denote the exalted excellence and purity of Providence, the giver of all the blessings we enjoy. The keys are emblematical of the secrecy, power, and sovereignty of Divine Providence, and the helm of the ship indicates safety and protection, and that Providence is our director, defence and shield, in the most imminent dangers and difficulties. The

A Heidelbergi Káté 1563

- **27. K.:** *Mit értesz az Isten gondviselésén?*
- **F.:** Istennek mindenható és mindenütt jelen való erejét, mellyel a mennyet és földet, minden teremtménnyel együtt, mintegy saját kezével még most is fenntartja. És úgy igazgatja, hogy fák és füvek, eső és szárazság, termékeny és terméketlen évek, étel és ital, egészség és betegség, gazdagság és szegénység és minden más dolog nem véletlenségből, hanem az Ő atyai kezéből jő.
- **28. K.:** *Mit használ az, ha tudjuk, hogy Isten teremtett mindeneket és gondviselésével még most is fenntartja?*
- **F.:** Azt, hogy mindennemű viszontagságban türelmesek, a boldogságban háládatosak lehessünk. És mindabban, ami még ránk jöhet: jó reménységben legyünk a mi hűséges Istenünk és Atyánk iránt: hogy egy teremtmény sem szakaszthat el minket az Ő szerelmétől. Mert annyira az Ő kezében van minden teremtmény, hogy az Ő akarata ellen semmit sem tehet, de még csak meg sem mozdulhat.

Egy XVII. századi holland: Gondviselés és világkereskedelem

- “God by His divine providence, wanting not only to bestow everything which may serve to bring felicity of His creatures, but also desiring to create amity and a universal society ... has diversified lands and climates so each country produces something ... not common elsewhere. And wishing to exchange surplus for [products] more rare, a country must have recourse to that universal correspondence and mutual exchange which we call commerce”.

Adam Smith keze (III.)

- Mivel tehát minden egyén tőle telhetően azon van, hogy tőkéjét a hazai iparkodás szolgálatába állítsa, egyszersmind ezt az iparkodást olyan irányba terelje, hogy annak a terméke a lehető legnagyobb értékű legyen, szükségképpen arra törekszik, hogy a társadalom évi jövedelmét tőle telhetően növelje. Általában persze nem áll szándékában előmozdítani a közérdeket, s nem is tudja, hogy mennyire mozdítja azt elő. Amikor a hazai iparkodás támogatását részesíti előnyben a külföldiével szemben, akkor csupán a saját biztonságát kívánja elősegíteni; amikor pedig ezt az iparkodást olyan irányba igyekszik terelni, hogy annak a terméke a lehető legnagyobb értékű legyen, akkor csak a saját javát kívánja szolgálni, s ebben, akár csak sok más esetben, egy láthatatlan kéz vezeti egy olyan cél felé, amely nem is szerepelt a terveiben.

J. Viner 1926 és 1966

- In his *Theory of Moral Sentiments*, Smith develops his system of ethics on the basis of the doctrine of a harmonious order in nature guided by God, and in an incidental manner applies his general doctrine with strict consistency to the economic order. In his later work, the *Wealth of Nations*, Smith devotes himself to a specialized inquiry into the nature of economic order.

Az eszmetörténészek ideológiai vaksága?

- For Adam Smith, all of this psychological apparatus is providential; it is designed by God for the benefit of mankind, and it is presumptuous for man, even if he be a moral philosopher...to find flaws in it.
- Historians of thought either put on mental blinders which hide from their sight the religious ingredients of Smith's thought or treat them as merely traditional and in Smith's day fashionable ornaments to what is essentially naturalistic and rational analysis of economic matters.

Edmund Burke 1795 – a „konzervatív” Smith-olvasat

I beseech the Government (which I take in the largest sense of the word, comprehending the two Houses of Parliament) seriously to consider that years of scarcity or plenty, do not come alternately or at short intervals, but in pretty long cycles and irregularly, and consequently that we cannot assure ourselves, if we take a wrong measure, from the temporary necessities of one season; but that the next, and probably more, will drive us to the continuance of it; so that in my opinion, there is no way of preventing this evil which goes to the destruction of all our agriculture, and of that part of our internal commerce which touches our agriculture the most nearly, as well as the safety and

very being of Government, but manfully to resist the very first idea, speculative or practical, that it is within the competence of Government, taken as Government, or even of the rich, as rich, to supply to the poor, those necessaries which it has pleased the Divine Providence for a while to withhold from them. We, the people, ought to be made sensible, that it is not in breaking the laws of commerce, which are the laws of nature, and consequently the laws of God, that we are to place our hope of softening the divine displeasure to remove any calamity under which we suffer, or which hangs over us.

Adam Smith + Edmund Burke = Margaret Thatcher?

- During the last decades of the twentieth century, the belief that an harmonious relationship can be established between Smithian economic liberalism and Burkean conservatism has been revived and disseminated.
- By combining the two positions one arrives at a spontaneous economic order that is the unintended outcome of individual choices, and a legal and governmental regime that respects custom and tradition while being protective of those 'little platoons' – the family, the Church, and other voluntary associations – that are thought to be essential to social cohesion and even nationhood.
- With little exaggeration one could say that this amalgam of Smith and Burke furnished the heady mixture of doctrines that fired the conviction politics of a recent British Prime Minister and her closest intellectual advisers.

Hitt-e Smith egy személyes Istenben? R. Coase 1976

were? According to Viner, Adam Smith thought that this was due to divine guidance, that man exhibited these harmonious characteristics because he had been created by God. It is difficult for us to enter the mind of someone living two hundred years ago, but it seems to me that Viner very much exaggerates the extent to which Adam Smith was committed to a belief in a personal God. As Viner himself notes, in those parts of the discussion where we would expect the word "God" to be used, it is rarely found and the word "Nature" is substituted or some such expression as "the great Architect of the Universe" or "the great Director of Nature" or even, on occasion, the "invisible hand."²⁷ It seems to me that one can gauge the degree of Adam Smith's

R. Coase: Smith, Isten és a természetes kiválasztódás

The fact of the matter is that, in 1759, there was no way of explaining how such a natural harmony came about unless one believed in a personal God who created it all. Before Darwin, Mendel and perhaps also Crick and Watson, if one observed, as Adam Smith thought he often did, a kind of harmony existing in human nature, no explanation could be given if one were unwilling to accept God the creator. My own feeling is that Adam Smith was reluctant to adopt this particular explanation. His use of the term "Nature" and other circumlocutions was rather a means of evading giving an answer to the question than the statement of one. Since Adam Smith could only sense that there was some alternative explanation, the right response was suspended belief, and his position seems to have come close to this. Today we would explain such a harmony in human nature as a result of natural selection, the particular combination of psychological characteristics being that likely to lead to survival. In fact, Adam Smith saw very clearly in certain areas the relation between those characteristics which nature seems to have chosen and those which increase the likelihood of survival.

Mensch! Erforsche die Gesetze meiner Schöpfung, und diesen Gesetzen gemäß handle!

- In the same way that He established order among His worlds [the planets, through gravitation and its law], He has established order among His human beings [. . .]
- In this way, He made sure that once man comprehends the laws pertaining to the operation of this force, every individual concerned exclusively with his own personal welfare must bend his efforts to the benefit of all men in a manner that is best for the welfare of all mankind.
- This, therefore, is the force that holds human society together; it is the bond that ties all men and forces them by advancing their own welfare through mutual exchange to further at the same time the welfare of others.



Isten éltesse János!